

# Mentoring Facilitators Meeting

Mitchell D. Feldman, MD, MPhil  
Director of Faculty Mentoring

June 2009

# Agenda

- Introductions
- Announcements
  - Upcoming CCFL events
- Mentor-Mentee Pairs: How are we doing?
- Facilitator check in: Innovations, challenges and new ideas
- The Art of Mentorship--findings from a qualitative study
- Website Demo (?)
- Plans/ideas for 2009 - 2010
  - (Mentor)ing evaluation
  - Mentor/mentee training
  - Speakers for natl mentoring month/award ceremony

# 2008-09 Target Mentees (N=873)

	School of Dentistry	School of Medicine	School of Nursing	School of Pharmacy
<u>Series</u>				
Ladder	5	24	6	7
In Residence	2	124	0	0
Clinical X	3	51	0	7
HS Clinical	9	341	16	9
Adjunct	5	246	13	5
Total	24	786	35	28

# 2008-09 Paired Mentees

	School of Dentistry	School of Medicine	School of Nursing	School of Pharmacy
Total Mentees	24	765	36	28
Paired Mentees	21	641	32	21
<b>Percent Paired</b>	<b>88%</b>	<b>84%</b>	<b>89%</b>	<b>75%</b>

# Agenda

- Introductions
- Announcements
  - Upcoming CCFL events
- Mentor-Mentee Pairs: How are we doing?
- Facilitator check in: Innovations, challenges and new ideas
- The Art of Mentorship--findings from a qualitative study
- Website Demo (?)
- Plans/ideas for 2009 - 2010
  - (Mentor)ing evaluation
  - Mentor/mentee training
  - Speakers for natl mentoring month/award ceremony

# **The Art of Mentorship: *A Qualitative Analysis of the Characteristics of Outstanding Mentorship***

Radhika A. Ramanan MD, MPH

Christine Cho, MD, MPH, Patricia Arean, PhD

Mitchell D. Feldman, MD, MPhil

Departments of Medicine, Pediatrics, Psychiatry and  
the Faculty Mentoring Program,  
University of California, San Francisco  
San Francisco, CA

# Background

What do we know:

- Catalyst for career success
- Influential in career selection, advancement and productivity

Little is known about:

- How to define outstanding mentorship
- Lack of specific guidance for mentors

# Specific Aims

- Identify qualities of outstanding mentors as described in letters of nomination for a lifetime achievement award in mentorship

# Description of database

- Lifetime Achievement in Mentoring Award
  - Outstanding senior faculty mentor who has demonstrated a long-term commitment to faculty mentoring in the academic health sciences
- Letters of nomination:
  - Specific qualities of the mentor
  - Why the nominee merits recognition
  - Contributions to the mentee's career

# Description of Database

- Selected top ten nominees
  - 2008 Award Year
  - Ranked by 4 specific criteria including:
    - Impact on career development; productivity; quality of nomination letters and overall “breadth and depth” of mentoring
  - Reviewed 4-6 letters per nominee
  - Letters were blinded of identifying information prior to qualitative analysis

# Qualitative Analysis

- Initially review to identify common themes and to design a coding algorithm
- Grounded theory approach and constant comparative technique
- Validated themes by external review of experts in the field

# Demographic Characteristics of Mentee nominators

- 53 letters analyzed
- Nominator characteristics:
  - 62% women
  - 23% non-UCSF academic affiliation
  - 40% Professor
  - 15% Associate Professor
  - 30% Assistant Professor

# Demographic Characteristics of Mentor nominees

- 10 Finalists (29 Faculty nominees)
- Represent 4 schools (Medicine, Dentistry, Nursing, Pharmacy) - and 22 Departments or Divisions
- 53-78 years of age
- 30% women

# Major Themes

- Admirable personal qualities
- Mentor as a career “shepherd”
- Longitudinal relationships
- Integration of personal and professional life
- Legacy of mentoring

# Admirable personal qualities

- Mentors exhibit:
  - Enthusiasm
  - Humility
  - Generosity
  - Empathy
  - Selflessness

# Admirable qualities

*“This act of selflessness, putting [me] forward for such an opportunity, is one of numerous examples of his character, which is unfalteringly honest, humble, insightful and inspiring.”*

# Mentor as a Career Shepherd

- Mentor offers a vision
- Purposefully individualizes and tailors support to each mentee
- Special attention to providing opportunities for advancement

# Career Shepherd

*“He knows what each plant in his garden needs to thrive: this one a little more sun, this one more fertilizer; This is a good metaphor for his mentoring [as] he takes the same careful approach with ‘growing’ his fellows and takes great joy in watching them bloom.”*

# Longitudinal Relationships

- Commitment can span decades
- Often extends past boundaries of project, discipline or institution

# Longitudinal Relationship

*“During the launching of my career, [he] was like a Solid Rocket Booster, ensuring that I achieve the lift and trajectory to make it into orbit. But rather than dropping off at that point, he has remained a constant feature, like Mission Control, monitoring my progress.”*

# Integration of Personal and Professional Life

- Support attention to personal life and family
- Acknowledge the importance of work-life balance

# Integration of Personal and Professional Life

*“ We have spent countless hours... planning my career, talking about family and how to live meaningfully and find happiness and balance in the workplace and home.”*

# Legacy of Mentoring

- Mentors leave a legacy through:
  - Role modeling, direct teaching and creating departmental policies that set global expectations and standards for mentorship
- Techniques of mentoring are visible through generations of mentors

# Legacy of Mentoring

*“I have drawn upon my experiences as [her] mentee to shape my mentoring style... I recall proudly smiling at the many shared qualities that [her] “family tree” of researchers has in common. As a branch in the tree, I can trace my growth and support, and that of my mentees to the main trunk of the tree, [my mentor].”*

# Implications

Suggestions for academic leaders:

- Inform the development of mentor training programs
- Develop criteria to evaluate the quality of academic mentoring and to provide feedback to mentors

# Agenda

- Introductions
- Announcements
  - Upcoming CCFL events
- Mentor-Mentee Pairs: How are we doing?
- Facilitator check in: Innovations, challenges and new ideas
- The Art of Mentorship--findings from a qualitative study
- Website Demo (?)
- Plans/ideas for 2009 - 2010
  - (Mentor)ing evaluation
  - Mentor/mentee training
  - Speakers for natl mentoring month/award ceremony